# THE SOUTH AFRICAN JOURNAL OF **BIOETHICS & LAW** JULY 2018 Vol. 11

## CONTENTS

#### **EDITORIAL**

3 The Life Esidimeni tragedy Arbitration award: A step in the direction of justice A Dhai

#### **CORRESPONDENCE**

4 **Euthanasia and our worldview** J V Larsen

#### **ARTICLES**

Life Esidimeni deaths: Can the former MEC for health and 5 public health officials escape liability for the deaths of the mental-health patients on the basis of obedience to 'superior orders' or because the officials under them were negligent?

D J McQuoid-Mason

8 Healthcare in crisis: A shameful disrespect of our Constitution

A Dhai, S Mahomed

**Employer-generated complaints to the statutory** 11 registration authority: The regulatory framework for the supervision of employed health professionals in the South African public sector

D T Hagemeister

- Legal implications of data sharing in biobanking research 15 in low-income settings: The Nigerian experience S O Akintola
- 20 What the contract does not say... A current analysis of what's missing in clinical trial agreements G Agar, L J Burgess
- Gender-affirming care in the context of medical ethics -24 gatekeeping v. informed consent A Tomson
- 29 Human guinea pigs? The ethics of undergraduate and postgraduate student involvement in medical training in South Africa M de Roubaix

35 The need to develop objective criteria for suitability as a surrogate mother: Reflections on Ex Parte KAF D W Thaldar

38 Should the state fund assisted reproductive technologies for HIV-discordant couples in South Africa who want to have children? A W Moodley

**EDITOR** Ames Dhai. Wits

CO-EDITOR David McQuoid-Mason. UKZN

**EDITORIAL BOARD** David J McQuoid-Mason. UKZN Freddy Mnyongani. UNISA Liz Gwyther. UCT Leslie London. UCT Peter Cleaton-Jones. Wits J P van Niekerk. HMPG Joseph Mfutso-Bengo. University of Malawi Godfrey B Tangwa. University of Yaounde Alexander Morgan Capron. University of S California Daniel Wikler. Harvard TH Chan School

#### **HMPG**

CEO AND PUBLISHER Hannah Kikaya Email:hannahk@hmpg.co.za

**EXECUTIVE EDITOR Bridget Farham** 

MANAGING EDITORS Claudia Naidu Naadia van der Bergh

**TECHNICAL EDITOR** Kirsten Morreira

**PRODUCTION AND ADMINISTRATION MANAGER** Emma Jane Couzens

SENIOR DESIGNER Clinton Griffin

**CUSTOMER SERVICE AND ONLINE SUPPORT** Gertrude Fani

FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATION Tshepiso Mokoena

**HMPG BOARD OF DIRECTORS** Prof. M Lukhele (Chair) Dr M R Abbas Mrs H Kikaya Dr M Mbokota Dr G Wolvaardt

ISSN 1999-7639



43 Can the consent provisions in the Choice on Termination of Pregnancy Act, which do not require children to be assisted by a parent or guardian, be used for live births by caesarian section in emergency situations?

D J McQuoid-Mason

#### **REVIEW**

46 Is there room for religious ethics in South African abortion law? *F Jogee* 

### **FORUM**

- Witnessing injustice: What is the student's role in advocating for patients?

  N Ramagaga
- 56 **CPD**